

CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza  
New York, NY 10006-1470

T: +1 212 225 2000

F: +1 212 225 3999

clearygottlieb.com

WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW  
FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG  
BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

D: +1 212-225-2086  
jrosenthal@cgsh.com

STEVEN M. LOEB  
CRAIG B. BROD  
NICOLAS GRABAR  
DAVID E. BRODSKY  
RICHARD J. COOPER  
JEFFREY S. LEWIS  
PAUL J. SHIM  
STEVEN L. WILNER  
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ  
DAVID C. LOPEZ  
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG  
LEV L. DASSIN  
JORGE U. JUANTORENA  
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER  
DAVID LEINWAND  
DIANA L. WOLLMAN  
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL  
MICHAEL D. DAYAN  
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.  
JEFFREY D. KARPFF  
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW  
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO  
FRANCESCA L. ODELL  
WILLIAM L. MCRAE  
JASON FACTOR  
JOON H. KIM  
MARGARET S. PEONIS  
LISA M. SCHWEITZER  
JUAN G. GIRÁLDEZ  
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN  
CHANTAL E. KORDULA  
BENET J. O'REILLY

ADAM E. FLEISHER  
SEANA A. O'NEAL  
GLENN P. MCGROARY  
MATTHEW P. SALERNO  
MICHAEL J. ALBANO  
VICTOR L. HOU  
ROGER A. COOPER  
LILLIAN TSU  
AMY R. SHAPIRO  
JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK  
ELIZABETH LENAS  
LUKE A. BAREFOOT  
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER  
DANIEL LAN  
MEYER H. FEDIDA  
ADRIAN R. LEPSIC  
ELIZABETH VICENS  
ADAM J. BRENNEMAN  
ARID. MACKINNON  
JAMES E. LANGSTON  
JARED GERBER  
COLIN D. LLOYD  
RISHI ZUTSHI  
JANE VANLARE  
DAVID H. HERRINGTON  
KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI  
AARON J. MEYERS  
DANIEL C. REYNOLDS  
AUDRY X. CASUSOL  
JOHN A. KUPIEC  
ABENA A. MAINOO  
HUGH C. CONROY, JR.

JOSEPH LANZKRON  
MAURICE R. GINDI  
KATHERINE R. REAVES  
RAHUL MUKHI  
ELANA S. BRONSON  
MANUEL SILVA  
KYLE A. HARRIS  
LINA BENSMAN  
ARON M. ZUCKERMAN  
KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI  
MARK E. McDONALD  
F. JAMAL FULTON  
RESIDENT PARTNERS  
SANDRA M. ROCKS  
JUDITH KASSEL  
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU  
BOAZ S. MORAG  
MARY E. ALCOCK  
HEIDE H. LGENFRITZ  
ANDREW WEAVER  
HELENA K. GRANNIS  
JOHN V. HARRISON  
LAURA BAGARELLA  
JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD  
SUSANNA E. PARKER  
DAVID W.S. YUDIN  
RESIDENT COUNSEL  
LOUISE M. PARENT  
OF COUNSEL

November 15, 2021

VIA ECF

The Honorable Robert W. Lehrburger  
United States Magistrate Judge  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, NY 10007

Re: *Vale S.A. v. BSG Resources Limited*, No. 19-cv-3619 (VSB) (RWL)

Dear Judge Lehrburger:

With Your Honor's indulgence, we respectfully submitted as ECF No. 89 a revised version of our letter dated November 12, 2021 in order to correct a portion of our submission regarding the proposed challenge to the arbitral award (only the second paragraph of the revised version has been modified, and we can provide a redline should the Court so desire). We note that under Rule III(B), today was the due date for our response.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

Jeffrey A. Rosenthal  
Lisa M. Schweitzer  
Lisa Vicens  
CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN &  
HAMILTON LLP  
One Liberty Plaza  
New York, New York 10006  
T: 212-225-2000  
F: 212-225-3999  
*Counsel for Vale S.A.*

cc: All Counsel via ECF